

INDIA HATE LAB'S FLAWED REPORT LACKS CREDENCE

Published February 13, 2025 Publication No. R0635-130225



India Hate Lab's flawed report lacks credence
The report smacks of selective amnesia, prejudiced frameworks, overlooks rising crimes on
Hindus, seeks to bring about divisiveness

Centre for Integrated and Holistic Studies (CIHS) is a non-partisan, independent, research think tank headquartered in New Delhi, India. CIHS is dedicated to enriching individual decision making by presenting innovative ideas, fostering informed public debate, and advancing effective policy and programme development to advance humanity. Aspiring to positively shape the future of society, CIHS works to share knowledge on pressing global challenges and opportunities by fostering a 'culture of scholarship' and advancing informed public engagement.

Every effort is made to ensure that the information contained in these publicly available briefings, fact sheets, reports, are correct at the time of publication. However, if you have any comments on our documents, please email info@cihs.org.in

Disclaimer and Limitation of Liability: This report is for public distribution and has been furnished solely for information and must not be reproduced or redistributed to others without written consent. None can use the report as a base for any claim, demand or cause of action and, also none is responsible for any loss incurred based upon the report.

<u>India Hate Lab's (IHL)</u> 2024 report on Hate Speech Events claims that hate speech incidents increased significantly in the country and Hindu nationalist organizations, ruling Bharatiya Janata Party (BJP) were behind these crimes.

A closer examination however throws up methodological flaws in the 'agenda' based study laced with prejudices, dubiousness of the publishing institute.

The report's inconsistent data collection, selective incident framing, turbulent agenda of IHL and its parent group, Center for the Study of Organized Hate (CSOH) have to fore.

IHL & CSOH illegitimate

Before digging into details of the report, it is critical to assess legitimacy of the institution that created it. IHL is an initiative of CSOH, a Washington, D.C.-based nonprofit that lacks transparency in its funding, affiliations and research standards. Several causes raise concern:

- Lack of Transparency: CSOH does not reveal its financing sources, making it opaque to evaluate any external impacts. Given its concentration on India, one crucial question arises: does the organization get funding from entities with vested geopolitical interests? Western think tanks have long history of supporting reports that support their narratives and ignoring counter-data.
- Selective Focus on India: Although hate speech is a global problem, CSOH's overemphasis on India—while neglecting comparable or worse cases in other regions—indicates a possible agenda-driven strategy. The organization is eloquently silent on sharp increase in hate crimes against certain communities in Islamic countries in recent years.
- Lack of Peer Review and Scholarly Rigor: In contrast to reputable academic research institutions, CSOH's work doesn't seem to go thorough peer evaluation which calls into question reliability of its data or conclusions. Furthermore, its credibility is diminished by lack of independent verification.

Flawed Data Manipulation

The report's flawed methodology which mostly depends on arbitrary interpretations and unreliable sources is a significant cause for concern.

• Social Media shadow: As per the report, "995 videos were traced back to original sources on social media."... Disinformation, deep fake content and out-of-context videos are all common on social media. Instead of blindly depending on unverified user-generated content, scholarly effort would independently investigate claims on the ground. Falsifying social media profiles for malicious intent is a common occurrence. Then, how does this report verify who owns the account or identity? By looking at the account's

- stated username? In what ways does this report guarantee whether accounts are run by Hindus or non-Hindus? Are the videos posted authentic or edited?
- Undefined Criteria: The report states that it defines hate speech using UN framework. But it doesn't clarify how it makes the distinctions between hate speech, political discourse and counter-speech. Many utterances that are classified as "hate speech" may actually be political campaign rhetoric which is a common practice in democracies across the globe.
- Uncontrolled Data: To determine whether India's trajectory is unusual or consistent with worldwide trends, a reliable study would compare hate speech data with comparable trends in other democracies, such as United States, United Kingdom or any other. Report paints a distorted picture and isolates India by not doing so.
- Acknowledge Political Bias: The analysis largely ignores hate speech from opposition parties, extreme Islamo-leftist outfits and separatist movements in favour of concentrating on BJP. In addition to being deceptive, this story is purposefully written to support a preconceived notion.

Rising Hate Crimes Against Hindus

According to India Hate Lab, hate speech directed at minorities is on the rise; however, data from the Hinduphobia Tracker shows contrasting facts:

- Anti-Hindu Hate Crimes: There have been more than 327 documented instances of anti-Hindu violence in India in 2024 alone including targeted assassinations, mob attacks and temple desecrations.
- **Hindu Worship places targeted:** In 2024, there were more than 85 instances of Hindu temple vandalism or destruction, many of which were driven by hatred toward faith. Imbalanced reporting of these instances is evident from the fact that they receive little to no coverage.
- **Hindus Targeted for Their Faith:** More than 50 documented incidents of Hindus being harassed or intimidated for expressing their faith or identity are highlighted in reports. The idea that hate speech exclusively targets minorities demands closer scrutiny.
- **Selective Outrage:** Abundant evidence of growing animosity towards Hindus notwithstanding, these occurrences receive little to no attention in contrast to the IHL report which predominantly focuses on alleged anti-minority hate speech.

Who is targeting Hindus if hate crimes against minorities are allegedly on the rise? Hinduphobia Tracker data indicates that crimes against Hindus are minimized or disregarded while victim narratives are deliberately emphasized.

Omission of Hate Speech on Hindus

The report's apparent failure to acknowledge hate speech by opposition parties, extreme Islamic groups and non-Hindu groups is an enormous flaw. Among the examples are:

- Opposition Leaders communal articulation: Despite making inflammatory remarks against Hindus, leaders of several opposition parties are not included in the study.
- Extremism by Other Communities: Radical Islamist and separatist rhetoric has been heard throughout India especially in Tamil Nadu, Kerala and West Bengal. Such cases are intentionally ignored or set aside indicating a selective emphasis.

With lack of credibility, transparency, and empirical rigour, India Hate Lab 2024 Report on Hate Speech Events in India is an agenda-driven analysis. It uses unconfirmed social media data, exaggerates statistical claims without providing adequate context and deliberately targets Hindus while neglecting more general hate speech trends.

The disparate information from different sources reveals a willful effort to overlook the rising number of attacks on Hindus and Hindu-owned places of worship.

In order to effectively combat hate speech, a fair, fact-based strategy that looks at all extremist sources rather than cherry-picking data to support a predetermined theory of victimhood. Since India is the largest democracy in the world, it deserves a fair and impartial examination rather than a biased criticism.

CIHS | Centre for Integrated and Holistic Studies

Centre for Integrated and Holistic Studies (CIHS) is an non-partisan, independent, research think tank headquartered in New Delhi, India. It is committed to bringing innovative ideas to the society, fostering informed public debate, promoting good policy and programme formulation.

Ultimately, enhancing individual decision-making on some of the world's most pressing issues.

